

**Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of the Equivalence & Accreditation Committee held on
22nd March 2013 at 11.00 am in Mural Hall of the Higher Education Commission,
Islamabad**

The 3rd meeting of the Equivalence & Accreditation Committee statutory body of Higher Education Commission was held on 22nd March 2013 at 11.00 am in the Mural Hall, HEC Islamabad. The meeting was attended by the following:

- | | | |
|----|--|------------------|
| 1 | Dr. Javaid R. Laghari,
Chairman, Higher Education Commission
Islamabad | Chair |
| 2 | Prof. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed
Executive Director
Higher Education Commission
Islamabad | Member |
| 3 | Prof. Dr. Imtiaz Galani
Vice Chancellor
UET, Peshawar | Member |
| 4 | Prof. Dr. Khawaja Azam Ali
Managing Director (QAA)
Higher Education Commission
Islamabad | Member |
| 5 | Mr. Fida Hussain
Director General (A&A)
Higher Education Commission
Islamabad | Member/Secretary |
| 6 | Mr. Muzaffar Ahmad Zia
Director (cord)
Inter Board Committee of Chairman (IBCC)
Islamabad | Member/Secretary |
| 7 | Following were attended meeting by special invitation
Mr. Muhammad Javaid Khan
Advisor Academic
Preston University
Islamabad | Expert |
| 8 | Dr. Shahzada Almigir Khan
Associate Professor
Institute of Communication Technologies
PTCL, Islamabad | Expert |
| 9 | Mr. Zahid Majeed
Assistant Professor
Allama Iqbal Open University
Islamabad | Expert |
| 10 | Dr. Amjad Hussain
Director A&A
Higher Education Commission
Islamabad | Expert |

Mr. Muhammad Ramzan Achakzai Secretary IBCC could not attend the meeting and was represented by Mr. Muzaffar Amed Zia Director (Cord), IBCC Islamabad.

Proceedings

The meeting started with the name of Almighty "Allah". The Chairman welcomed the members and sought clarification as to why the meeting is convened at such a belated stage. Responding, the former Adviser (Acad) pointed out that in view of the blanket approval by Equivalence Committee of the erstwhile UGC (University Grants Commission) in its 17th meeting held on 20-03-1986 vide resolution which reads as **"Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates awarded by accredited universities may be treated in general as equivalent to corresponding degrees/diploma/certificates from Pakistan"** the needful calling was seldom felt. He particularly noted that degree/qualifications are recognized on the principle of reciprocity, and as such Pakistan recognizes the qualifications awarded by universities in their home country/s. The Committee desired that at least Equivalence and Accreditation Committee must meet twice a year. The Committee also discussed the various issues regarding launching of new degree programs by the universities without consulting HEC. The former Adviser (Acad) stated that such degree program is the exclusive domain of the universities/DAIs and concurrence by the Commission may not be necessary. The Committee however desired that all universities should be bound to consult the Commission being sole agency for recognition of qualification. The Chairman advised to convey all the charter universities of public and private sectors to provide information regarding degrees being issued by them specifying their nomenclatures and to flout on their website as well. Further, the Chairman directed to reconsider validation of degrees with nomenclatures like D-Pharma, DVM, and DPT etc being Bachelor degree but bearing Doctor as prefix, and directed to convey all the recognized universities to get prior approval from the HEC before stating any new degree programme, otherwise such degrees which are issued without getting approval would not be attested.

The Committee took up the regular agenda and following decisions were taken unanimously:

Item No. 1: To consider Doctor of Business Administration degree awarded by the Philippine School of Business Administration, Philippines equivalent to Ph.D. degree from Pakistan.

Mr. Fida Hussain, D.G. (A&A) gave briefing to the Committee regarding the issue as mentioned below:

1. HEC has granted equivalence to Syed Akif Hasan regarding his Doctor in Business Administration (DBA) degree awarded by the Philippine School of Business Administration, Manila, Philippines with M.S/M.Phil NOT Ph.D.
2. Applicant file a writ petition against this decision in Honorable Sindh High Court praying remedy as the decision was taken without presenting his case in Equivalence Committee.

3. Brief of the case is that as per system of education in Philippines according to a UNESCO publication titled "World Guide to Higher Education" A Comparative Survey of Systems, Degrees and Qualification.
 - a. Admission requirement to University: (10 Year Schooling).
 - b. Bachelor's degree: (4 + 10 years Schooling).
 - c. Master's degree: (01 or 02 Year + 14 years Schooling).
 - d. Doctor's degree (doctorate): (2 + 15 or 16 years Schooling).
 - e. Summary: Total 17 or 18 years Schooling are required for Ph.D. in Philippine.

Qualification record of the applicant from Matric onward is summarized as under:

	That Degree/certificate	Board/Univ.	Year of passing	Year of	Schooling
	Total				
i.	Matric	BSSE, Karachi	1986	10	10
ii.	Intermediate	BSSE, Karachi	1988	02	12
iii.	B. Com	Univ. of, Karachi	1992	02	14
iv.	MBA	Catholic Univ. Philippine	1994	02	
		16			
v.	DBA	School of Business Administration	1995	01	17
		Manila			

After thorough discussion; the Committee reiterated that the previous stance taken by the Special Committee and as conveyed to Syed Akif Hasan is correct, and recommended that Degree of DBA (one year schooling) held by Syed Akif Hasan, which is obtained after MBA (16 year schooling) is hereby equated to new MBA=MS since standard of Old MBA has been raised to the level of MS.

Item No. 2: To Consider Equivalence of MS Computer Networks And Communication Degree Awarded By Hamdard University Karachi With M. Phil.

Background of the case is:

Mr. Masood Raza (Hamdard University Karachi) did his B.Sc. (Hons) in Physics (3-year) + M.Sc. Physic (1-year) and then he did Post Graduate Diploma in Computer Science (1-year) as a gap arrangement to further go for higher studies in Computer Networks & Communications; After that he did 2-year MS Computer Networks & Communication degree from Hamdard University Karachi. Mr. Masood Raza applied to this Commission for determining his MS Computer (Networks & Communications degree) equivalency as M. Phil involving 18-year schooling.

After thorough discussion; it was agreed MS (Computer Networks & Communications) held by Mr. Masood Raza from Hamdard University, Karachi be accepted as equivalent to MS having 18 years of schooling (CS) in relevant field.

Item No. 3: To Consider Equivalence of M.Sc. in Molecular Biology & Biotechnology Degree Awarded by the University of Lahore with M.Sc. Botany or Zoology.

Ms. Nureen Zahra (University of Lahore) did her MSc. in Molecular Biology & Biotechnology and apply this commission to determine equivalency of her degree with M.Sc. Botany or Zoology.

After thorough discussion; it was noted by the Committee that degree (Molecular Biology & Biotechnology) held Ms. Nureen Zahra is specialized degree in field of Molecular Biology & Biotechnology and also admission requirement may differ from Bio-Chemistry, Botany, Animal Sciences & Medical Sciences. Therefore this case be deferred and referred to Universities for expert opinion.

Item No. 4: To Consider M.A Special Education Degree Awarded By Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad Equal To M.A Education.

Mr. Saifur-Rehman & Mr.Abdur-Rehman (Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad) has applied to determine equivalency of their degrees (M.A Special Education) with M.A Education.

The Committee noted that degree (M.A Special Education) held Mr. Saifur-Rehman & Mr.Abdur-Rehman is specialized degree in field Special Education cannot be treated as equivalent to general degree in education and therefore this case be deferred and sent to Universities for expert opinion.

Item No. 5: To Consider M.A Political Studies Degree Awarded By Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad With M.Sc Political Science

Ms. Zaib-un-Nisa (Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad) has applied to this commission for determining equivalency of her M.A Political Studies Degree awarded By Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad with MSc Political Science.

After thorough discussion; the Committee noted that M.A Political Science & M.A Political Studies are similar in contents and with different nomenclature only. It is agreed upon that the equivalence may be granted on following grounds:-

It was agreed upon that expert opinion may be solicited from universities/curriculum Division and if 2/3 courses are common with each other then equivalence may be determined, after getting proper approval from the Chairman, HEC, Islamabad.

Item No. 6: To Consider B.Sc. Computer Engineering and B.Sc. Computer System Engineers Degree Equivalence to Master of Computer Science.

Mr. Muhammad Zubair Khan (Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan) has applied to this commission for determining equivalency of his BSc (Computer System Engineering) to with MCS BSc (Computer System Engineering) to equate with MCS.

Moreover a query as well from PSC for clarification whether B.Sc. Computer Engineering or Software Engineering degrees are equivalent in contents and discipline with BS Computer Science or M.Sc. Computer Science or IT.

The Committee noted that the degrees mentioned in item No. 6, in spite of having a few commonalities in the study courses, differ in level of format of courses and nomenclature of the degrees as well. Therefore, all of the above mentioned degrees vide item No. 6 cannot substitute each other. It was agreed NOT to recognize the degree as equivalent to MSc/MSc (CS) are BS(CS).

Item No. 7. To Consider Equivalence of PhD in Chemistry Degree Awarded By the Lahore College For Women University With PhD Botany.

Ms. Tahira Aziz Mughal, PhD has applied to this commission to equate her PhD (Chemistry) with PhD (Botany). She is MSc in Botany. Title of her thesis is "Ethno Medical Studies of Flora of Southern Punjab and Isolation of Biologically Active Principles."

After thorough discussion; it was agreed upon by the Committee that (PhD in Chemistry) held by Ms. Tahira Aziz Mughal cannot be equated to Ph.D. (Botany).

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the chair.

**Minutes of the 2nd Meeting of the Equivalence & Accreditation Committee held on
June 25, 2003 at 2.00 p.m. in the Mural Hall of the Higher Education Commission,
Islamabad**

Item No. 4/2 To consider the recognition of degrees granted by universities in private sector in Pakistan.

The Committee having considered different proposed hypothetical options noted that the recommendation letter for grant of charter from the Commission or the No Objection Certificates to the universities/institutions in private sector were issued on the basis of academic, financial and physical infrastructure available with them. The Committee therefore, decided:

- a) To validate the degrees awarded to students who qualified the terminal examination after the date of grant of charter by the Federal or Provincial Governments.
- b) To validate the degrees obtained from foreign universities through local institutions running collaborative/franchise degree programmes from the date of issue of NOC or Recommendation Letter and subject to the condition that these institutions are finally registered and allowed to operate in territorial jurisdiction of respective public university and provincial Education Department. In case of institutions in Federal Capital Territory, the approval of Higher Education Commission will stand mandatory for recognition of degrees.
- c) HEC will in future not grant an NOC or Recommendation Letter to any body wishing to operate in a province or AJ&K unless it has obtained clearance from the respective Provincial/AJK Governments.
- d) The Director General (Administration) is to convene a meeting of Provincial Secretaries of Education under Chairmanship of Executive Director for formulation and adoption of a uniform policy on grant of charter based on recommendations for charter by the HEC may be considered as a pre-requisite for effective implementation of the criteria for the establishment of a new university or an institution of higher education as approved by the Federal Cabinet in its meeting held on February 27, 2002.

Item No. 6/2 Consideration of affiliation rules for universities/institutions in private sector.

The Committee noted that the private universities with Federal charter or from the Provincial Governments have misused the provisions of powers to affiliate institutions and have extended this power even beyond their territorial jurisdiction just to extract maximum financial benefits. They are involved in granting low quality degrees. It is upon realization of this fact that the Federal Cabinet had approved the minimum requirements for an establishment of a university or an institution of higher education which contained provisions that the institution to be affiliated by university in private sector need to be approved by Higher Education Commission and that the private Universities granted charter prior to February 2002 will have power to grant affiliation withdrawn. It was observed that no action towards this end has been taken by the Commission as well as the Provincial Education Departments. It was therefore, decided that:

“A letter may be written by Prof. Dr. Atta-ur-Rahman, Chairman, Higher Education Commission requesting the President of Pakistan, President of AJ&K and the Provincial Governors to issue Ordinances repealing the power of affiliation of institutions and providing for inspection of institutions to be affiliated by these private universities. The Ordinance to this effect will be drafted by Higher Education Commission”.

Item No.7/2 To consider the status of degrees awarded by the accredited foreign institutions through their offshore campuses in Pakistan.

The Committee considered the issues involved and noted that there are two types of institutions operating in collaboration with foreign universities offering foreign degrees in Pakistan.

- (1) The institutions having the curriculum, scheme of study materials, examinations papers set & assessment of answer sheets as well as declaration of results done by the franchising university. For this type of institutions, the following criteria for recognition of degrees were agreed:
- (2) The institutions carrying out collaborative degree programmes with foreign universities which are offering foreign degrees through arrangements wherein the curricula of foreign universities are taught, assessed and evaluated locally and final results are send to foreign affiliating university for issue of degrees, the parameters set-forth hereunder and approved in 1st meeting of Equivalence & Accreditation Committee will apply:
 - a) Top ranked universities in the world may be allowed to run their degree programmes in Pakistan without imposing any condition in collaboration with Pakistani partners, but after completing the legal and procedural requirements as laid down in at Sr. No. 1.1 to 3.3 (xviii) and from 3.5 to 3.9.8 of Guidelines for Collaboration of Institutions of Higher Education in Pakistan with Universities Abroad. To elaborate his point of contention, the Chairman stated that since such high profile universities/institutions are more concerned about the reputation of their degrees world over, they will themselves maintain and monitor the required parameters for imparting quality education.
 - b) Universities with good academic standing and reputation be clearly identified and allowed to run collaborative degree programmes in Pakistan after fulfilling the mandatory legal, procedural, constitutional requirements as prescribed by the Higher Education Commission. They may be allowed to operate in Pakistan after meeting the financial requirements on account of Endowment Fund, Tangible Assets & Working Capital as laid here under:

Endowment Fund (Secured in the name of Trust/Society	Rs. 5.00 million
Tangible Assets in the form of land/building etc.	Rs.10.00 million
Working Capital	Rs.05.00 million
Total:	Rs.20.00 million

Possession of land for built up infrastructure
4 Kanals

- All other accredited foreign universities, desirous of collaborating with Pakistani partners may enter into an agreement for collaborative degree programmes or those who want to have franchising arrangements with Pakistani institutions, the sponsors will be required to fulfill all the pre-requisites as specified for a degree awarding institute in the guidelines/criteria for establishment of a university/degree awarding institute as approved by the Federal Cabinet in its meeting 27th February, 2002. The requirements to be met in full are: